

1

5

AS

PATENT

IN THE UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

In re:

Application of

Myron L. Munn

Serial No.:

10/829,005

Filed:

April 21, 2004

Title:

OIL FILTER ADAPTER

Group No.:

1723

BEFORE THE BOARD OF PATENT APPEALS AND INTERFERENCES

Appeal No. _____

10

APPELLANT'S REPLY BRIEF TO EXAMINER'S ANSWER

Commissioner for Patents
Alexandria, VA 22313

Dear Sir:

15

In the Examiner's Answer, at page 6 thereof, the Examiner argues that the

preamble relies upon the intended use of the oil filter and does not add any structural

limitation to the claimed oil filter adapter. The Examiner is apparently unaware of the

applicable case law. A claim preamble has the import that a claim as a whole

suggests for it. <u>Bell Comm. Research v. Vitalink Comm. Corp.</u>, 55 F.3d 615, 34

USPQ2d 1816 (Fed. Cir. 1995). Generally, the preamble does not limit the claim.

DeGeorge v. Bernier, 768 F.2d 1318, 226 USPQ 758 (Fed. Cir. 1985). However,

statements appearing in the preamble may be necessary to give meaning to the

claim and properly define the invention. Bell Comm. Research v. Vitalink Comm.

Corp., 55 F.3d 615, 34 USPQ2d 1816 (Fed. Cir. 1995). Whether a preamble stating

25

20

an intended purpose constitutes a limitation to the claim depends on whether the language is essential to particularly point out the invention. <u>Diversitech Corp. v. Century Steps, Inc.</u>, 850 F.2d 675, 7 USPQ 1315 (Fed. Cir. 1988). The Federal Circuit has said that a term that breathes life into the claims is a necessary limitation even though it appears in the preamble. <u>Loctite Corp. v. Ultraseal Ltd.</u>, 781 F.2d 861, 228 USPQ 90 (Fed. Cir. 1985).

In this case, the preamble does breathe life into the claims and is a necessary limitation. The prior art relied upon by the Examiner does not anticipate the claimed subject matter under 35 U.S.C. § 102 nor does the prior art make the claimed subject matter obvious under 35 U.S.C. § 103. Accordingly, Appellant contends that the Examiner's final rejection should be reversed.

Respectfully submitted,

15

10

1

5

DENNIS L. THOMTE Registration No. 22,497 THOMTE LAW OFFICE, L.L.C. Attorneys of Record

2120 South 72nd Street, Suite 1111 Omaha, NE 68124 (402) 392-2280

20

CERTIFICATE OF MAILING

DENNIS L. THOMTE